

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF WISCONSIN  
GREEN BAY DIVISION

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA and )  
THE STATE OF WISCONSIN, )  
 )  
Plaintiffs, ) Civil Action No. 10-C-910  
 )  
v. ) Hon. William C. Griesbach  
 )  
NCR CORPORATION, *et al.*, )  
 )  
Defendants. )  
 )

**PLAINTIFFS' JOINT MOTION TO ENTER CONSENT DECREE WITH BROWN  
COUNTY, THE CITY OF GREEN BAY, AND SETTLING FEDERAL AGENCIES**

The United States and the State of Wisconsin hereby move the Court to approve and enter a pending proposed Consent Decree that was lodged with the Court on December 1, 2010 (Dkt. 31-1). That Consent Decree would resolve two categories of potential liability for the Lower Fox River and Green Bay Superfund Site: (1) the alleged liability of Brown County, the City of Green Bay, and the U.S. Government (on behalf of the U.S. Army Corps of Engineers) for dredging-related activities and other steps to facilitate navigation in the Lower Fox River and Green Bay; and (2) the alleged liability of agencies of the U.S. Government for activities relating to the recycling of PCB-containing paper by mills in the Fox River Valley. The settlers would pay a total of \$5.2 million under the proposed Consent Decree, and that payment would reduce the liability of the other potentially responsible parties by the amount of the settlement, as provided by 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f)(2). Of that total amount, the United States would pay \$4.5 million and the City and the County would pay \$350,000 each. One portion of the settlement would defray response costs (\$850,000) while a second portion would reduce the claim for natural resource damages (\$4,350,000).

After the proposed Consent Decree was lodged with the Court, notice of the proposed settlement with a solicitation of public comments was published in the Federal Register. 75 Fed. Reg. 76,025 (Dec. 7, 2010). At the request of several defendants in this case, the original 30-day comment period was extended by an additional six weeks until February 25, 2011. Before the close of the comment period, the U.S. Department of Justice provided those defendants electronic copies of more than 48,000 pages of documents concerning Army Corps activities at the Site and federal recycling, in response to Freedom of Information Act requests they submitted in December 2010. Seven sets of comments were received, including comments from: (1) Appleton Papers Inc. and NCR Corporation; (2) P.H. Glatfelter Company; (3) Menasha Corporation; (4) U.S. Paper Mills Corp.; (5) CBC Coating, Inc.; (6) WTM I Company; and (7) the Neenah-Menasha Sewerage Commission. All of them oppose the settlement, arguing that the settlement is procedurally unfair, substantively unfair, and/or unreasonable. The written comments – and the more significant attachments to those comments – are attached as exhibits to this Motion.

The Plaintiffs' brief in support of this motion provides pertinent background information, it reviews the legal standards governing court approval of the proposed settlement, it explains the factors that were considered in devising the proposed settlement, and responds to particular issues raised in the written comments on the settlement by the objectors. A related set of settlement calculation worksheets is attached to this motion. As demonstrated in the accompanying brief, the Court should approve and enter the Consent Decree notwithstanding the commenters' objections.

### **Conclusion**

The Court should approve and enter the proposed Consent Decree.

Plaintiffs' Joint Motion to Enter Consent Decree in *United States and the State of Wisconsin v. NCR Corp., et al.*, Civil Action No. 10-C-910 (E.D. Wis.)

Respectfully submitted,

For the United States of America

IGNACIA S. MORENO  
Assistant Attorney General  
Environment and Natural Resources Division

Dated: July 10, 2011

s/ Randall M. Stone  
RANDALL M. STONE  
JEFFREY A. SPECTOR  
IVA ZIZA  
Environmental Enforcement Section  
Environment and Natural Resources Division  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 7611  
Washington, DC 20044-7611  
Telephone: 202-514-1308  
Facsimile: 202-616-6584  
E-Mail: [randall.stone@usdoj.gov](mailto:randall.stone@usdoj.gov)

Dated: July 10, 2011

s/ Joshua M. Levin  
JOSHUA M. LEVIN  
MATTHEW R. OAKES  
PERRY M. ROSEN  
Environmental Defense Section  
U.S. Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 23986  
Washington, D.C. 20026-3986  
Telephone: 202-514-4198  
[joshua.levin@usdoj.gov](mailto:joshua.levin@usdoj.gov)

GREGORY J. HAANSTAD  
Attorney for the United States, Acting  
Under Authority Conferred by 28 U.S.C. § 515

SUSAN M. KNEPEL  
Assistant United States Attorney  
Office of the United States Attorney  
517 E. Wisconsin Avenue, Room 530  
Milwaukee, WI 53202

For the State of Wisconsin

Dated: July 10, 2011

s/ *Cynthia R. Hirsch*  
CYNTHIA R. HIRSCH  
Assistant Attorney General  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
17 West Main Street  
P.O. Box 7857  
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that, on this day, the foregoing Motion was filed electronically with the Clerk of the Court using the Court's Electronic Court Filing System, which sent notification of such filing to the following counsel:

**Mary Rose Alexander**  
Latham & Watkins LLP  
[mary.rose.alexander@lw.com](mailto:mary.rose.alexander@lw.com)

**Thomas Armstrong**  
von Briesen & Roper SC  
[tarmstro@vonbriesen.com](mailto:tarmstro@vonbriesen.com)

**Paul Bargren**  
Foley & Lardner LLP  
[pbargren@foley.com](mailto:pbargren@foley.com)

**Linda E. Benfield**  
Foley & Lardner LLP  
[lbenfield@foley.com](mailto:lbenfield@foley.com)

**Dennis P. Birke**  
DeWitt Ross & Stevens SC  
[db@dewittross.com](mailto:db@dewittross.com)

**Steven P. Bogart**  
Reinhart Boerner Van Deuren SC  
[sbogart@reinhartlaw.com](mailto:sbogart@reinhartlaw.com)

**Michael P. Carlton**  
von Briesen & Roper SC  
[mcarlton@vonbriesen.com](mailto:mcarlton@vonbriesen.com)

**Evan R. Chesler**  
Cravath Swaine & Moore LLP  
[echesler@cravath.com](mailto:echesler@cravath.com)

**Marc E. Davies**  
Greenberg Traurig LLP  
[daviesm@gtlaw.com](mailto:daviesm@gtlaw.com)

**Brandon J. Evans**  
Hermes Law Ltd.  
[bje@hermeslawtld.com](mailto:bje@hermeslawtld.com)

**Sandra C. Goldstein**  
Cravath Swaine & Moore LLP  
[sgoldstein@cravath.com](mailto:sgoldstein@cravath.com)

**Thomas R. Gottshall**  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd PA  
[lgantt@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:lgantt@hsblawfirm.com)

**Eric W. Ha**  
Sidley Austin LLP  
[eha@sidley.com](mailto:eha@sidley.com)

**Scott W. Hansen**  
Reinhart Boerner Van Deuren SC  
[shansen@reinhartlaw.com](mailto:shansen@reinhartlaw.com)

**William H. Harbeck**  
Quarles & Brady LLP  
[william.harbeck@quarles.com](mailto:william.harbeck@quarles.com)

**Michael L. Hermes**  
Hermes Law Ltd.  
[mlh@hermeslawtld.com](mailto:mlh@hermeslawtld.com)

**Cynthia R. Hirsch**  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
[hirschcr@doj.state.wi.us](mailto:hirschcr@doj.state.wi.us)

**Caleb J. Holmes**  
Greenberg Traurig LLP  
[holmesc@gtlaw.com](mailto:holmesc@gtlaw.com)

**Philip C. Hunsucker**  
Hunsucker Goodstein & Nelson PC  
[phunsucker@hgnlaw.com](mailto:phunsucker@hgnlaw.com)

**Paul G. Kent**  
Stafford Rosenbaum LLP  
[pkent@staffordlaw.com](mailto:pkent@staffordlaw.com)

**Susan E. Lovern**  
von Briesen & Roper SC  
[slovern@vonbriesen.com](mailto:slovern@vonbriesen.com)

**Kevin J. Lyons**  
Davis & Kuelthau SC  
[klyons@dkattorneys.com](mailto:klyons@dkattorneys.com)

**Karl S. Lytz**  
Latham & Watkins LLP  
[karl.lytz@lw.com](mailto:karl.lytz@lw.com)

**David G. Mandelbaum**  
Greenberg Traurig LLP  
[mandelbaumd@gtlaw.com](mailto:mandelbaumd@gtlaw.com)

**Tara M. Mathison**  
Davis & Kuelthau SC  
[tmathison@dkattorneys.com](mailto:tmathison@dkattorneys.com)

**Stephen F. McKinney**  
Haynsworth Sinkler Boyd PA  
[smckinney@hsblawfirm.com](mailto:smckinney@hsblawfirm.com)

**Heidi D. Melzer**  
Hermes Law Ltd.  
[hdm@hermeslawltd.com](mailto:hdm@hermeslawltd.com)

**Elizabeth K. Miles**  
Davis & Kuelthau SC  
[emiles@dkattorneys.com](mailto:emiles@dkattorneys.com)

**Sabrina Mizrachi**  
Greenberg Traurig LLP  
[mizrachis@gtlaw.com](mailto:mizrachis@gtlaw.com)

**Monique M. Mooney**  
Greenberg Traurig LLP  
[mooneym@gtlaw.com](mailto:mooneym@gtlaw.com)

**William J. Mulligan**  
Davis & Kuelthau SC  
[wmulligan@dkattorneys.com](mailto:wmulligan@dkattorneys.com)

**Daniel C. Murray**  
Johnson & Bell Ltd.  
[murrayd@jbltd.com](mailto:murrayd@jbltd.com)

**Kelly J. Noyes**  
von Briesen & Roper SC  
[knoyes@vonbriesen.com](mailto:knoyes@vonbriesen.com)

**Nancy K. Peterson**  
Quarles & Brady LLP  
[nancy.peterson@quarles.com](mailto:nancy.peterson@quarles.com)

**Thomas M. Phillips**  
Reinhart Boerner Van Deuren SC  
[tphillip@reinhartlaw.com](mailto:tphillip@reinhartlaw.com)

**Joan Radovich**  
Sidley Austin LLP  
[jradovich@sidley.com](mailto:jradovich@sidley.com)

**Ronald R. Ragatz**  
DeWitt Ross & Stevens SC  
[rrr@dewittross.com](mailto:rrr@dewittross.com)

**Alexandra Reeve Givens**  
Cravath Swaine & Moore LLP  
[agivens@cravath.com](mailto:agivens@cravath.com)

**Kathleen L. Roach**  
Sidley Austin LLP  
[kroach@sidley.com](mailto:kroach@sidley.com)

**Megan A. Senatori**  
DeWitt Ross & Stevens SC  
[ms@dewittross.com](mailto:ms@dewittross.com)

**Sarah A. Slack**  
Foley & Lardner LLP  
[sslack@foley.com](mailto:sslack@foley.com)

**Margaret R. Sobota**  
Sidley Austin LLP  
[msobota@sidley.com](mailto:msobota@sidley.com)

**James P. Walsh**  
Appleton City Attorney  
[jim.walsh@appleton.org](mailto:jim.walsh@appleton.org)

**Ted Waskowski**  
Stafford Rosenbaum LLP  
[twaskowski@staffordlaw.com](mailto:twaskowski@staffordlaw.com)

**Evan B. Westerfield**  
Sidley Austin LLP  
[evanwesterfield@sidley.com](mailto:evanwesterfield@sidley.com)

**Richard C. Yde**  
Stafford Rosenbaum LLP  
[ryde@staffordlaw.com](mailto:ryde@staffordlaw.com)

**Patrick J. Ferguson**  
Latham & Watkins LLP  
[patrick.ferguson@lw.com](mailto:patrick.ferguson@lw.com)

**Linda R. Larson**  
Marten Law  
[llarson@martenlaw.com](mailto:llarson@martenlaw.com)

**Bradley M. Marten**  
Marten Law  
[bmarten@martenlaw.com](mailto:bmarten@martenlaw.com)

**Meline G. MacCurdy**  
Marten Law  
[mmaccurdy@martenlaw.com](mailto:mmaccurdy@martenlaw.com)

Dated: July 10, 2011

*s/ Randall M. Stone*